

ROCK HILL BOARD OF HISTORIC REVIEW

City of Rock Hill, South Carolina

September 2, 2021

A regular public hearing of the Rock Hill Board of Historic Review was held Thursday, September 2, 2021, at 6:00 pm in City Council Chambers at City Hall, 155 Johnston Street, Rock Hill SC.

MEMBERS PRESENT Ashley Barron, Jana Jeanette, Martin Goode, Phil Jerauld, Michael James, William Drennan, and Amy Applegate

MEMBERS ABSENT None

STAFF PRESENT Janice Miller, Shana Marshburn, and Eric Hawkins

3. Approval of minutes from the April 1, 2021 regular meeting.

Ms. Jana Jeanette made a motion to approve the minutes from the April 1 public hearing. Mrs. Ashley Barron seconded, and the motion carried unanimously by a vote of 7-0.

4. Approval of minutes from the July 1, 2021 regular meeting.

Mr. William Drennan made a motion to approve the minutes from the July 1 public hearing. Ms. Jeanette seconded, and the motion carried unanimously by a vote of 7-0.

5. Recognize Addie Mayfield Rutledge for 20 years of service.

Staff member Janice Miller, along with the members of the Board, recognized Addie Mayfield Rutledge for her 20 years of service on the Board and presented her with a plaque.

6. Introduce new Board member, Amy Applegate.

Mrs. Miller introduced Mrs. Amy Applegate as the Board's newest member, noting that she was replacing Addie Mayfield Rutledge who had recently retired from serving on the Board.

7. H-2021-05: Hold public hearing and consider a Certificate of Appropriateness request by Addie Mayfield Rutledge to replace the porch decking, columns on side porch, and trim boards with alternative materials on the building located at 353 Oakland Avenue, which is part of the Oakland Avenue Area Historic District, tax parcel 627-22-02-015.

Staff member Janice Miller presented the staff report. The Board, having no questions for staff, called the applicant to speak.

Elizabeth Colquhoun, 353 Oakland Avenue, approached the Board. Ms. Colquhoun provided the board with a sample of the material to be used for the porch, noting that it would be the same profile and be tongue and groove. She also provided a physical example of a wood grain PVC material and explained that the prior material had suffered from rot. She went on to explain how the gutter system played a major role in the excessive rot. The Board had no further questions for Ms. Colquhoun.

Michael James asked whether vinyl siding was already present. Janice Miller noted that the home had been included on the National Register of Historic Places even though vinyl siding had been installed. Mrs. Barron added that usually the smooth side is used and noted that this would be a condition.

There being no further discussion, Chair Jerauld made a motion to approve the request. Mr. Drennan seconded. Mrs. Miller interjected asking the Board whether they would like to add the condition that the smooth side be

used. Mr. James added that retaining the ionic capitals on the columns should also be added. Chair Jerauld revised the motion to include the conditions. Mr. Drennan seconded, and the motion carried unanimously by a vote of 7-0.

8. **H-2021-06: Hold public hearing and consider a Certificate of Appropriateness request by First Presbyterian Church to install a columbarium area on the front of the building located at 234 East Main Street, which is an individually designated historic property, tax parcel 627-18-06-001.**

Staff member Janice Miller presented the staff report.

Mr. James asked whether the church was planning on adding landscaping. Mrs. Miller stated that they were. The Board had no questions for the applicant. There being no further discussion, Chair Jerauld called for a motion. Vice Chair Goode made a motion to approve the request. Ashley Barron seconded, and the motion carried unanimously by a vote of 7-0.

9. **H-2021-07: Hold public hearing and consider a Certificate of Appropriateness request by Maurice Walker to install gutters and replace the secondary and rear façade windows with vinyl replacement windows on the building located at 240 Marion Street, which is part of the Marion Street Area Historic District, tax parcel 600-04-02-004.**

Staff member Janice Miller presented the staff report. With no questions of staff, the Board called the applicant to speak. Maurice Walker, of 1432 Flintwood Drive and Myron Walker of 240 Marion Street approached the Board.

Chair Jerauld asked whether there was any update on what else was taking place regarding the renovation. Mr. Walker stated that drywall was currently going up and should be finished within the next 5 to 6 days. He added that all electrical and HVAC was being replaced.

Ms. Jeanette questioned whether the windows would be wood or vinyl. Mr. Walker responded stating that they were proposing to use vinyl. Ms. Jeanette asked Mr. Walker whether he would be opposed to using wood instead of vinyl. Mr. Walker stated that the vinyl would last much longer and would require less upkeep than wood. He added that he would like to use vinyl on the rear of the home. Chair Jerauld inquired about the steps that were deteriorating. Mrs. Applegate stated that she was okay with the side windows and asked how the gutters would look and if they would be standard 5-inch gutters. Mr. Drennan followed up on the discussion surrounding the gutters, asking if they would be present at both rooflines. Michael James asked Mrs. Miller whether the historic guidelines require the gutters be the same color as the house. Ms. Jeanette added that she had seen the house and recognized that it did need gutters. She added that she could consider allowing the vinyl windows on the rear of the home instead of the sides. Mrs. Applegate asked Mr. Walker whether he'd be comfortable if the board only allows vinyl windows on the rear and requires wood windows on the sides. She added that she knew that the home has structural issues. Mrs. Barron commented that the house has deteriorated from neglect and that she appreciates the applicant taking on this project.

With no further discussion, Chair Jerauld called for a motion. Mr. James made a motion to approve the request subject to the condition that the wood windows on the front and secondary façades be preserved. Ms. Jeanette asked Mr. James whether his motion excluded the requirement for wood windows on the rear of the house. She went on to clarify that she was okay with using wood on the front and sides and vinyl on the rear, which includes the smaller windows. Mr. James clarified that his motion was to only require wood on the front and sides and to allow vinyl on the rear. Chair Jerauld seconded the motion, and it carried unanimously 7-0.

10. **H-2021-08: Hold public hearing and consider a request by Southern Builders (Jeff Williamson) to amend Certificate of Appropriateness 1099 to allow for fluted columns rather than smooth columns on the building located at 417 East White Street, which is part of the Reid Street/North Confederate Avenue Area**

Historic District, tax parcel 627-04-01-003.

Staff member Janice Miller presented the staff report.

Michael James asked the reasoning for this issue coming before the Board. Mrs. Miller stated that staff drove by the property and noticed that the incorrect columns had been installed. She added that in this case, the applicant had the choice of complying or coming before the Board and asking for an amendment to the Certificate of Appropriateness. The Board having no further questions for staff, the Board invited the applicant to speak.

Patrick Williamson, 150 Oakland Ave., Suite 201, approached the Board. Ms. Jeanette inquired as to why the fluted columns were installed instead of the style that was approved. Mr. Williamson stated that he had purchased the home two years ago and that it had previously been used as a spa and was in bad shape. He added that he had been renovating hoping to be done by Christmas, but that they did make a mistake and thought that they had originally requested fluted columns instead of smooth columns. He went on to reference that there were other homes with fluted columns in the area. Furthermore, the house had experienced a fire and so the columns that were on the home were not the original columns.

The Board had no further questions for the applicant and went into discussion. Ms. Jeanette stated that the fluted columns looked out of place. Mr. Drennan asked whether the Board had looked at the historical context when the request initially came before the Board. Mrs. Miller replied that the Board did. Mrs. Barron stated that she was concerned that the columns did not match what was there before and that approving the modification would be a slippery slope. Mr. Drennan agreed that allowing the modification would not set a good precedent. Mrs. Barron added that in the past, in these situations, the Board had required the applicant to remove unapproved materials.

Mr. Williamson approached the Board stating that he tried to find pictures of the home and that the earliest that he could find was from 1988. Ms. Jeanette stated that even though there were no pictures, the general rule is to replicate what is existing and that the fluted columns were too far from that to allow. Mrs. Barron added that there is a photo of a half of a column, which was smooth, and could have been indicative of the other columns being smooth. Ms. Jeanette questioned Mrs. Miller of what the alternative would be if the Board were to vote against it. Mrs. Miller replied stating how the item should be voted on, stating that a motion could be made and the Board vote in either favor or opposition of that motion. With that said, Chair Jerauld made a motion to approve. Michael James seconded and the motion failed by a vote of 0-7 with all members voting in opposition.

11. H-2021-09: Hold public hearing and consider a Certificate of Appropriateness request by Comporium Communications to install signage on the side of the building located at 117 Elk Avenue, which is part if the Downtown (Old Town) Area Historic District, tax parcel 627-18-03-007.

Chair Jerauld noted that this item has been deferred and no action was taken.

12. Other Business

- a. Staff approved COAs.

Mrs. Miller presented the list of COA's that have been approved by staff since the last Board meeting.

- b. Vote to move October hearing from October 7th to October 14th.

Chair Jerauld made a motion to approve the request. Mrs. Barron seconded, and motion carried unanimously by a vote of 7-0.

- c. Boards and Commission dinner

Mrs. Miller provided information about the upcoming Boards and Commissions dinner and encouraged all

members to attend.

d. Staff updates.

Mrs. Miller announced that Eric Hawkins has been promoted from Planner III to Planning Manager and Shana Marshburn has been promoted from Planner I to Planner II.

c. Continuing education opportunities.

Mrs. Miller presented information about upcoming continuing education opportunities.

13. Adjourn

There being no further business, Chair Jerauld made a motion to adjourn. Mrs. Barron seconded, and the motion carried unanimously by a vote of 7-0. The meeting adjourned at 7:00 PM.